

Note on the Sources for Fig. 9.1 of Brian DeLay, "Blood Talk: Violence and Belonging in the Navajo-New Mexican Borderland," in Juliana Barr and Edward Countryman, eds. Contested Spaces of Early America (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014), 229-256.

The database from which Fig. 9.1 is derived is comprised of information culled secondary works. Frank D. Reeve, longtime editor of the *New Mexican Historical Review*, produced the first comprehensive histories of Navajo-Spanish relations based on a wide variety of official records. Reeve never collected his work into a single volume, but his articles in the NMHR are still of the first importance to chronicling this history. See especially Frank D. Reeve, "The Navaho-Spanish Peace: 1720s-1770s," *New Mexico Historical Review* 34, no. 1 (1959); Frank D. Reeve, "Navaho-Spanish Diplomacy, 1770-1790," *New Mexico Historical Review* 35, no. 3 (1960); and Frank D. Reeve, "Navaho Foreign Affairs, 1795-1846," *New Mexico Historical Review* 46, no. 2-3 (1971), published posthumously (the title of this last article is slightly misleading: the editors only completed and published this final project of his up to the year 1824.) Reeve was a careful researcher and practiced a style of history that privileged a year-by-year exhumation of the historical record above interpretive analyses; his work was especially suited to deconstruction into data.

Ward Alan Minge wrote in a similar style and also had a deep understanding of the archival evidence for Navajos in the nineteenth century. I have relied upon his dissertation for the 1840s: see "Frontier Problems in New Mexico Preceding the Mexican War, 1840-1846" (Ph.D. diss., University of New Mexico, 1966). Minge worked with Myra Ellen Jenkins on a chronological summary, transcriptions, and

exegesis of the surviving documentary evidence bearing on Navajo activities in the Spanish and Mexican periods for the Indian Claims Commission. Their published report provides a useful summary of key documents, and was helpful for the database. See Myra Ellen Jenkins and Alan Minge Ward, *Navajo Activities Affecting the Acoma-Laguna Area, 1746-1910* (New York: Garland Publishing, 1974). Frank McNitt's study of Navajo-New Mexican conflict, *Navajo Wars: Military Campaigns, Slave Raids, and Reprisals* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1972), helped to clarify occasional contradictions between Reeve, Minge, and Jenkins. For baptismal and burial records, as well as events, I rely heavily on the remarkable, pioneering work of David M. Brugge, *Navajos in the Catholic Church Records of New Mexico, 1694-1875*, 2nd ed. (Tsaile, Ariz.: Navajo Community College Press, 1985). (Note his discussion of methodology and numbers, where Brugge estimates that he consulted perhaps 70% of the baptismal records produced during the years of his study, p. 2.). Finally, the dataset draws upon J. Lee Correll's exacting, multi-volume chronicle, *Through White Men's Eyes: A Contribution to Navajo History - A Chronological Record of the Navaho People from Earliest Times to the Treaty of June 1, 1868* (Window Rock: Navajo Times Pub. Co., 1976).

Two specific problems with the data deserve discussion. First, New Mexican officials seem sometimes to have minimized the casualties their forces suffered while campaigning against Navajos. Especially after Independence, the norm was to say little about Mexican losses on these campaigns. From the few diaries and accounts that seem to be complete, it does seem clear that Mexican losses were usually negligible, compared to Navajo casualties. This was not always the case,

however. In 1835 for example, Navajo warriors ambushed a Mexican force campaigning in Navajo territory and killed a great many, including the expedition's two leaders. Even here, though, no source has been found that tallies the final Mexican losses; it seems that the bodies were not taken back to New Mexico's parishes for burial, so church records do not help in this matter.

The second serious blind spot in the database concerns the activities of private New Mexican slavers or campaigners. McNitt, James Brooks, and others suggest that unauthorized, private slaving was likely a widespread (and naturally unrecorded) phenomenon. Baptismal records are of limited use identifying such slaving campaigns, because New Mexicans regularly purchased Navajo captives from other Indians. That said, the baptismal record matches the narrative of peace and war established in the traditional documentation quite well. This suggests that the significance of private slaving has been exaggerated, at least for the years before American rule. All told, then, the numbers presented in "Blood Talk" should be considered under-estimations, though probably not by more than 10-20%. The imbalanced ratio of Mexican/Navajo casualties are unlikely to be meaningfully altered by additional data.

Finally and more generally, this dataset is offered as a rough work in progress. Beyond omissions of the kind described above, it doubtlessly contains errors that I introduced myself while assembling it, and that the authors I've relied upon made when they produced their own studies. I'd be much obliged to readers willing to point out problems (delay@berkeley.edu). I will gratefully correct errors and incorporate new information, noting changes in the 'notes' field of the dataset.

For all its flaws, I hope it will be of use to students of Navajo-New Mexican relations; and I hope that it offers some small encouragement to borderland historians to incorporate more basic quantitative analysis into their scholarship.

Abbreviations used in excel dataset:

- **Mexican:** shorthand for Spanish subjects or Mexican citizens, regardless of racial/ethnic background
- **N:** Navajo
- **#:** indefinite number; few
- **##:** indefinite number; many
- **Animals:**
 - **H:** Horses
 - **S:** Sheep
 - **C:** Cattle
 - **M:** Mules
- **Source:**
 - **Reeve, 1960:** Frank D. Reeve, "Navaho-Spanish Diplomacy, 1770-1790," *New Mexico Historical Review* 35:3 (1960)
 - **Reeve, 1971:** Frank D. Reeve, "Navaho Foreign Affairs, 1795-1846," *New Mexico Historical Review* 46:2-3 (1971)
 - **B:** David M. Brugge, *Navajos in the Catholic Church Records of New Mexico, 1694-1875*, 2nd ed. (Tsaile, Ariz.: Navajo Community College Press, 1985)

- **TWME:** J. Lee Correll ed. *Through White Men's Eyes: A Contribution to Navajo History - A Chronological Record of the Navaho People from Earliest Times to the Treaty of June 1, 1868.* Window Rock: Navajo Times Pub. Co., 1976.
- **JM:** Myra Ellen Jenkins and Alan Minge Ward, *Navajo Activities Affecting the Acoma-Laguna Area, 1746-1910* (New York: Garland Publishing, 1974)
- **MG:** Ward Alan Minge, "Frontier Problems in New Mexico Preceding the Mexican War, 1840-1846" (Ph.D. diss., University of New Mexico, 1966)
- **M:** Frank McNitt, *Navajo Wars: Military Campaigns, Slave Raids, and Reprisals* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1972)